

**WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
CALLED MEETING & PUBLIC HEARING
OCTOBER 1, 2019, 6:50 PM
GREAT HALL – WELLESLEY TOWN HALL**

Members Present: Chair David Smith, Vice-Chair Lisa Abeles, Eric Cohen, Amy Griffin, Emily Maitin, Tom Paine. **Absent:** Edwina McCarthy.

Staff: Dana Marks, Planner

Others Present: John Chapman; Catherine Johnson, Planning Board Chair; Patrick McMahon; Jared Powell

Call to Order: David Smith called the meeting to order at 6:50 pm.

Public Hearing HDC 19-06 - 22 Cottage Street - Certificate of Appropriateness, Continued. Seeing as the applicant was not present when the meeting was called to order, Mr. Smith delayed hearing the continuation of the Public Hearing from September 3, 2019 until the other two applicants were heard.

All documents from the Commission meeting are on file in the Planning Department.

Mr. Smith invited the applicant Patrick McMahon to come before the Commission for the continuation of the Public Hearing from September 3, 2019, regarding 22 Cottage Street.

Mr. McMahon circulated new renderings and drawings of the proposed staircase off of the back deck, which was changed based on comments from the previous Public Hearing. In the new configuration, the stairs would be kept behind the house so they could not be seen from public view. Mr. McMahon circulated a photograph from Denton Road – towards the back of the property – to further show how it was not visible.

Ms. Griffin noted that the changed location of the proposed stair from the back deck was a vast improvement.

Ms. Abeles asked for specifications regarding details, namely the types of caps on the tops of posts and building materials. The “Nantucket cap,” or similar flat pyramid-shaped cap, was determined to be the preferred type of cap, and was agreed upon by the Commission and Mr. McMahon. The Commission requested that Mr. McMahon bring samples to the Planning Department.

Ms. Abeles was also adamant that the vertical flat board underneath the deck must have space between each board. Mr. McMahon explained the original proposals and plans called for wood, and he intends to use stained wood, specifically fir. Mr. Cohen asked about the thickness of the railings, which he recommended be as robust as the building code allows to match the aesthetic of the other deck elements.

After considering the new material – which will be put in the Planning Department files – Ms. Griffin made a motion to accept the changes as proposed to the stair, porch, and railings, and grant the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Abeles seconded the motion. The Historic District Commission voted unanimously (6-0) to grant the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness based on the changes to the original proposal at 22 Cottage Street.

Public Hearing HDC 19-07 - 17 Cottage Street - Certificate of Non-Applicability. Mr. Smith introduced the Public Hearing for the Certificate of Non-Applicability for changes to 17 Cottage Street. John Chapman, architect on the project, came before the Commission to discuss the application, which included new windows, doors, a roof canopy, and an extension of bluestones steps at the rear of the house.

All documents from the Commission Meeting are on file in the Planning Department.

Mr. Smith was comfortable considering a Certificate of Non-Applicability, as he believed the proposed changes could not be seen from public view. However Ms. Griffin explained that some of the proposed changes could be seen from the side along Homestead Road. The existing double door at the kitchen – which is proposed to be replaced with three sliding French-style doors is visible.

Ms. Abeles asked for Mr. Chapman to clarify the projections on the new proposed roof canopy. Mr. Chapman explained that the projections would be two to three feet, and would try to simulate details from existing features. Ms. Abeles further requested that Mr. Chapman provide a sketch to further clarify, which he dutifully drew up while the Commission heard the next applicant.

Mr. Chapman produced a drawing of the side elevation of the proposed canopy and bracket detail. As indicated in the drawing and confirmed by the Commission and Mr. Chapman, there will be no gutter on the canopy. This drawing and accompanying notes regarding materials and window and door specifications were put into the record.

Mr. Paine commented that the current condition of 17 Cottage Street is a “hodge podge of openings,” and that the proposed aesthetic result would be more pleasing.

Mr. Smith noted that instead of a Certificate of Non-Applicability, the decision and vote made by the Commission should be for a Certificate of Appropriateness, due to the fact that some of the proposed changes are visible from public view, as noted earlier in the discussion by Ms. Griffin.

Ms. Abeles moved to grant the applicant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed changes to 17 Cottage Street, with the addition to the record of the new drawing and notes. Mr. Paine seconded the motion. The Historic District Commission unanimously voted (6-0) to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed changes to 17 Cottage Street.

Public Hearing HDC 19-08 - 33 Cottage Street - Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Smith introduced the Public Hearing for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of current windows with Pella Architect Series Reserve windows at 33 Cottage Street.

All documents from the Commission Meeting are on file in the Planning Department.

Jared Powell, the retail sales consultant from Pella, was present with window samples for the Commission. Mr. Powell explained that the Architect Series Reserve windows are composed of wood interior and aluminum exterior elements, and they are one of the most historically accurate windows on the market. The storm windows would be removed, as they would no longer be needed.

The Commission felt that the applicant needed to provide elevation drawings, or at the very least photographs of the elevations, to show existing windows and what the replacement windows would look like in their places.

Another concern from the Commission was that the replacement installation would alter the appearance of the openings because the old windows would be taken out, but their frames would remain, and the new full window system – frame and sash – would be inserted into the existing frame, therefore having a much thicker frame and less glass than what was originally present.

Ms. Abeles asked about the current condition of the windows, and what led the homeowners to opt for a full window replacement on all windows. Mr. Powell could not see any significant issues with the existing windows, however explained that he believed the homeowner’s concern with efficiency led them to wanting to replace their single-pane windows with storm windows to double-pane windows.

Supported by the Commission, Ms. Abeles strongly suggested that the homeowner comes to the next Commission meeting to explain their reasoning for pursuing window replacements. Ms. Abeles also mentioned that efficiency could be addressed by new storm windows, rather than replacement, and Ms. Griffin highlighted that storm window replacements are not within the purview of the Historic District Commission.

As the goal of the proposal is to replace all windows, it is important that the applicant return to the Commission with the specifications for all of the new windows, where they will be placed throughout the house, and images of what they will look like after installation.

Ms. Abeles made a motion to continue the Public Hearing of 33 Cottage Street on November 5, 2019. Mr. Paine seconded the motion. The Historic District Commission voted unanimously (6-0) to continue the Public Hearing of 33 Cottage Street at the next meeting on November 5, 2019.

Plan Discussion on HDC 19-05 - 638 Washington Street. Ms. Abeles is concerned that construction is not being built according to what was approved. The Commission reviewed the final approved drawings from a previous Large House Review and dated December 14, 2017. Some Commission members claim that the house that is being built does not match what was drawn and approved. Ms. Johnson recommended that it would be helpful to bring in photographs of what is being built to compare to the

drawings, and vice-versa. Bringing photographs to the Building Department for enforcement was suggested.

All documents from the Commission Meeting are on file in the Planning Department.

The Commission expressed a want to discuss the neighboring project, HDC 18-06 - 636 Washington Street, at its next meeting on November 5, 2019.

Approval of Minutes. The previously approved minutes from August 6, 2019, had typos that had since been addressed and corrected. Ms. Abeles moved to approve the minutes with the typos corrected. Mr. Smith seconded the motion. The Historic District Commission unanimously voted (6-0) to approve the minutes from August 6, 2019 with the typos corrected.

The minutes from September 3, 2019, were circulated to the Commission at the start of the current meeting. Commission members expressed a desire to take more time to carefully read these minutes, as they were transcribed from a recording by Danielle Marini, Natural Resources Commission Clerk, with the help of Ms. Johnson. They will be approved at the next meeting on November 5, 2019.

Historic Preservation Design Guidelines Discussion. Planning Department staff wanted to check in with the Commission on the status and timeline of the new Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, which are currently in draft form. The Commission requested that staff circulate the most recent draft via email and in print form.

Ms. Maitin expressed a desire to allow for more flexibility within the Design Guidelines. Other members noted that it is important to emphasize the importance of maintaining the integrity of single houses, since Wellesley has four single building historic districts in addition to the Cottage Street Historic District.

Once the Commission members review the draft Design Guidelines, they will meet together to discuss comments and suggestions before meeting once more with Peter Benton, Principal at Heritage Strategies, LLC, who is the consultant party.

Adjourn. Mr. Smith asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Abeles made, and Mr. Paine seconded, a motion to adjourn the meeting. The Historic District Commission voted unanimously (6-0) in favor to adjourn the meeting at approximately 8:10 pm.

Next Meeting: November 5, 2019

Minutes Approved: December 3, 2019

Minutes Compiled by: Dana Marks, Planner