



STAFF REPORT

Town of Wellesley - Planning Department

Application: DR-2018-08– 42 Pine Plain Road - Preservation Determination
Subject Property: 42 Pine Plain Road (Assessor's Parcel ID #169-41)
Applicant: Michael Barrett
Property Owner: Michael Barrett
Date: Report prepared 6/28/2018 for 7/9/2018 Historical Commission Meeting
Staff Contact: Claudia Zarazua, Planner
Staff Recommendation: **Preferably Preserved**

APPLICATION OVERVIEW

An application for Eligibility Notice was submitted on February 2, 2018 and an application for Preservation Determination was submitted on May 31, 2018 indicating the intent to demolish, in its entirety, a building located on the property and used as a dwelling. An Eligibility Notice was issued on February 2, 2018 determining the subject building to be an Eligible Building. A public hearing before the Historical Commission was scheduled for July 9, 2018.

DESCRIPTION

In consideration of the application for Eligibility Notice, it was determined that the building was constructed no earlier than June 5, 1928 when the building permit "2880" for a dwelling and garage was issued. The property was originally part of the Cavanaugh Estate and owned by Margaret Cavanaugh. According to the Massachusetts Historical Commission report, in the late 1890s this area was part of a 67 ½-acre farm owned by the Cavanaugh Family. The farm was later subdivided and this particular parcel was acquired by Alice and Eustace Hood in 1934. Mr. and Mrs. Hood were longtime town residents and active members of St. Paul's Church. The property was put under the Hood Realty Trust in 1990. It was later sold to Shirley White Cooney in 2002. Mrs. White-Cooney was a realtor in town. It was then sold to Emel and Osman Atac and Michael and Ruya Barrett in 2005. In 2010, Mr. and Mrs. Barrett became the sole owners of the property.

According to the Wellesley building permit database, a rear bedroom with a bathroom was added in 1959, an extension to the garage was built in 1963, and an interior bathroom and kitchen renovation was permitted in 2003.

The dwelling is a 1.5-story building with a side-gabled roof, cladding and various additions. Staff believes the original architecture of the house is best characterized as a Cape Cod Cottage of the Colonial Revival style. The permit "No. 2880" for a dwelling and garage was issued to architect and builder James H. Davidson.

PRESERVATION DETERMINATION STANDARDS

In consideration of a Preservation Determination for the building, the Historical Commission is to determine whether or not the building should be Preferably Preserved, a term defined as building “the demolition of which that is proposed...would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town because such Building is (i) importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district.”

If the Commission determines that the Building should be Preferably Preserved, then no Demolition Permit with respect to such Building shall be issued until twelve (12) months after the date of the Preservation Determination.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is of the opinion that the subject building is **not** (i) associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, nor (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district, but that the building **is** (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings.

With respect to standard (ii), while the existing building has been altered, Staff is of the opinion that the dwelling still preserves architectural features and scale characteristic of the original neighborhood. While perhaps less architecturally important by itself, Staff is of the opinion that the dwelling is architecturally important in the context of the neighborhood.

Therefore, based upon the above, **Staff is of the opinion that demolition of the subject building would be detrimental to the historic or architectural heritage of the Town and recommends that the Historical Commission determine that the building be deemed Preferably Preserved.**