



STAFF REPORT

Town of Wellesley - Planning Department

Application: DR-2020-13 – 4 Earle Road – Preservation Determination
Subject Property: 4 Earle Road (Assessor's Parcel ID # 158-85)
Applicant: Michael & Katharine Daly
Property Owner: Michael & Katharine Daly
Date: Report prepared 6/3/2020 for 6/8/2020 Historical Commission Meeting
Staff Contact: Dana Marks, Planner
Staff Recommendation: **Preferably Preserved**

APPLICATION OVERVIEW

On May 7, 2020, the Applicants submitted an application for Eligibility Notice indicating the intent to demolish, in its entirety, a building located on the property and used as a dwelling. An Eligibility Notice was issued on May 8, 2020 determining the subject building to be an Eligible Building. The Applicants then submitted an application for Preservation Determination on May 18, 2020. The Historical Commission will hold a public hearing on the application for a Preservation Determination on June 8, 2020.

DESCRIPTION

In consideration of the application for a full/complete demolition and in determining whether or not the dwelling should be deemed Preferably Preserved, it was determined that the original dwelling was constructed no later than June 13, 1939, when Building Permit No. 6748 was granted for the construction of a "Dwelling." This source proves that the dwelling at 4 Earle Road is indeed Eligible and subject to a Preservation Determination pursuant to Article 46C of the Wellesley Town Bylaws.

The dwelling at 4 Earle Road is a two-story wood frame house built in the Colonial Revival style with a side gable roof. A central front entry door is framed by white pilasters and a flat crosshead, and one eight-over-eight double hung sash window sits on each side. The second story has three such windows evenly spaced. All five windows along the front façade are flanked by inoperable shutters. A garage, which was built at the same time as the dwelling (Building Permit No. 6749) is located to the right of the main structure, and an addition to the left was added in 1995 (Building Permit No. 28591). An additional porch and bay window were added in 1999 (Building Permit No. 31447).



Image via Assessor's Property Record Card.

Referred to as “Fred Martin & Son” on Building Permit No. 6748, Fred Martin was responsible for constructing 4 Earle Road as well as subdividing and developing the surrounding neighborhood with William Martin. As Trustees of the Fells Estate Trust, Fred and William acquired 6.222 acres from the Estate of Albion R. Clapp in 1938 (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 2189, Page 473). They proceeded to subdivide the land, which can be seen on Plan No. 29 of 1939 below. After constructing a house on Lot 43 in 1939, the Fells Estate Trust sold 4 Earle Road to M. Olive Rowen later that year (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 2245, Page 555).



4 Earle Road is now located on Lot 43, which is outlined in red. (Detail of Plan No. 29 of 1939 accessed via Norfolk County Registry of Deeds)

In 1944 J. Richard and Janice Williams acquired the property from M. Olive Rowen (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 2496, Page 437). In 1950 the Williams family sold the property to James and Betty Jane Reswick from Newtonville (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 2945, Page 298). James Reswick was a professor at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) in mechanical engineering after serving in the Navy during World War II.¹ Reswick received a doctor of science degree from MIT in 1954, and held many patents for various inventions.²

Frank and Jean Corley acquired the property in 1957 and moved in with their family from Norfolk, Virginia (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Page 3553, Page 484). Frank Corley was a graduate from the U.S. Naval Academy and served in the Korean War.³ In 1960 the Corleys sold 4 Earle Road to Gerald and Charlotte Giblin (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 3819, Page 274). The Giblins sold the property to Edward and Carol McGlinchey in 1965 (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 4318, Page 494). Edward McGlinchey was a manager of the New England Telephone and Telegraph Company and received his Master of Business Administration from Babson in 1969.⁴ In 1986 Edward McGlinchey transferred his right, title and interest to the property over to Carol McGlinchey (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 6928, Page 383). From 1986 to 2011, Carol McGlinchey held the property as the sole owner (1986-1993; 1999-2007), as Trustee of the Carol J. McGlinchey Trust (1993-1999), and as Trustee of the 4 Earle Road Realty Trust (2007-2011).

In 2011, Justin Harney and Meghan Harney acquired 4 Earle Road from the 4 Earle Road Realty Trust (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 29147, Page 320). The current owners acquired the property in 2017 (Norfolk County Registry of Deeds, Book 35067, Page 581) and are seeking a Preservation Determination.

PRESERVATION DETERMINATION STANDARDS

In consideration of a Preservation Determination for the building, the Historical Commission is to determine whether or not the building should be Preferably Preserved, a term defined as when a building, “the demolition of which that is proposed...would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town because such Building is (i) importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district.”

If the Commission determines that the Building should be Preferably Preserved, then no Demolition Permit with respect to such Building shall be issued until twelve (12) months after

¹ “Doctors, Professor, DuPont Mgr. Among Newcomers To Our Town,” *Wellesley Townsman*, October 19, 1950, page 5; “Prof. Reswick To Address Tenacre PTA,” *Wellesley Townsman*, February 5, 1959, page 7.

² “James B. Reswick Has M.I.T. Doctorate,” *Wellesley Townsman*, July 1, 1954, page 6.

³ “Newcomers To Wellesley,” *Wellesley Townsman*, May 23, 1957, page 2.

⁴ “Newcomers to Wellesley,” *Wellesley Townsman*, January 20, 1966, page 26; “Babson Institute,” *Wellesley Townsman*, June 26, 1969, page 7.

the date of the Preservation Determination. Following such a determination, the Applicant may request a reduction in the length of the delay period through the Waiver Process.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is of the opinion that the subject building at 4 Earle Road **is** (i) importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, **is** (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, and **is not** (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district.

With respect to standard (i), Fred Martin was a prominent builder and developer who was responsible for building numerous houses throughout the Town, as well as the neighborhood in which 4 Earle Road is situated.

With respect to standard (ii), 4 Earle Road has maintained its original Colonial Revival character, which enhances the integrity of the surrounding neighborhood.

Therefore, based upon the above, **Staff is of the opinion that the demolition of the subject building would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town and thus Staff recommends that the building should be deemed Preferably Preserved.**