



STAFF REPORT

Town of Wellesley - Planning Department

Application: DR-2017-38 – 6 Pinevale Avenue - Preservation Determination
Subject Property: 6 Pinevale Avenue (Assessor's Parcel ID # 198-72)
Applicant: Laurence D. Shind
Property Owner: Catherine L. Bean
Date: Report prepared 12/27/2017 for 1/9/2018 Historical Commission Meeting
Staff Contact: Claudia Zarazua, Planner; Michael Zehner, Planning Director
Staff Recommendation: **Not deemed Preferably Preserved**

APPLICATION OVERVIEW

Applications for Eligibility Notice and Preservation Determination were submitted on December 7, 2017 indicating the intent to demolish, in its entirety, a building located on the property and used as a dwelling. An Eligibility Notice was issued on December 12, 2017 determining the subject building to be an Eligible Building. A public hearing before the Historical Commission was scheduled for January 9, 2018.

DESCRIPTION

In consideration of the application for Eligibility Notice, it was determined that the dwelling was built between March 10, 1924, the date provided on Building Permit "No. 1465" for the construction of a "dwelling" at Pinevale Avenue, and 1927, when the building was first reported for tax valuation purposes under ownership of Fulton and Jennie S. Mattatoll in the 1928 Annual Report (the Applicant indicated the construction date to be 1920, relying on the Assessors Property Record Card). The building permit was preceded by the creation of lots numbered 303, 304, 305, 306, 307, and 308 as part of the Plan of Wellesley Manor, recorded at the Registry of Deeds in November 1913 and originally developed by John Hinston under ownership of Michael Connolly. The address was later changed to 6 Pinevale Avenue by Earl Robert May, in 1948.

The property was originally owned by Harriett and Michael Connolly and sold to Anna and William Edmunds in 1922. Then it was sold to John Hinston in 1924. Emile Hinston, widow of John Hinston, sold the property to Fulton and Jennie Mattatal in 1927 according to the Registry of Deeds. They filed a building permit in 1924 for a dwelling and later added a garage in 1929. In July 1937, it was sold to Earl Robert and Ruth May; they later built a poultry house according to building permit "6803" from July 1939. In August 1949, it was sold to William and Carolyn Greene. It was then sold to Catherine and George Bean in 1951. They later installed a new roof in 1965. In 1990, it was acquired by the current owner, Catherine Bean.

The dwelling is a 1.25-story with a side-gabled roof, minimally altered with a screened porch, detached garage, and poultry house. Staff believes the original architecture of the house is best characterized as Colonial Revival in the Cape Cod Cottage style.

PRESERVATION DETERMINATION STANDARDS

In consideration of a Preservation Determination for the building, the Historical Commission is to determine whether or not the building should be Preferably Preserved, a term defined as building “the demolition of which that is proposed...would be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town because such Building is (i) importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district.”

If the Commission determines that the Building should be Preferably Preserved, then no Demolition Permit with respect to such Building shall be issued until twelve (12) months after the date of the Preservation Determination.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is of the opinion that the subject building is **not** (i) associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the Town, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America, (ii) historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of Buildings, or (iii) located within one hundred fifty (150) feet of the boundary line of any federal or local historic district and contextually similar to the Buildings located in the adjacent federal or local historic district.

With respect to standard (ii), while the publically visible facades of the dwelling are believed to be original in their form (with the exception of the garage and enclosed porch), and at one point was likely consistent with the period of architecture of the immediate neighborhood, many of the homes in this area have been redeveloped in recent years and Staff is not of the opinion that the building is as architecturally important on its own.

Therefore, based upon the above, **Staff is of the opinion that demolition of the subject building would not be detrimental to the historical or architectural heritage of the Town and recommends that the Historical Commission determine that the building should not be deemed Preferably Preserved.**